UNDERSTANDING
WRONGFUL CONVICTION

The protection of the innocent
across Europe and America

Edited by
LUCA LUPÁRIA

2015
I diritti di traduzione, di memorizzazione elettronica, di riproduzione e di adattamento totale o parziale, con qualsiasi mezzo (compresi i microfilm e le copie fotostatiche), sono riservati per tutti i Paesi.

Le fotocopie per uso personale del lettore possono essere effettuate nei limiti del 15% di ciascun volume/fascicolo di periodico dietro pagamento alla SIAE del compenso previsto dall’art. 68, commi 4 e 5 della legge 22 aprile 1941, n. 633.

Le riproduzioni diverse da quelle sopra indicate (per uso non personale – cioè, a titolo esemplificativo, commerciale, economico o professionale – e/o oltre il limite del 15%) potranno avvenire solo a seguito di specifica autorizzazione rilasciata da EDISER Srl, società di servizi dell’Associazione Italiana Editori, attraverso il marchio CLEAreDi Centro Licenze e Autorizzazioni Riproduzioni Editoriali. Informazioni: www.clearedi.org.

L’elaborazione dei testi, anche se curata con scrupolosa attenzione, non può comportare specifiche responsabilità per eventuali involontari errori o inesattezze.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

RETHINKING THE APPROACH
TO WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN EUROPE:
SOME PRELIMINARY REMARKS

Luca Lupária

............................................................................................................. pag. 1

PART I
MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE: CRITICAL ISSUES
AND NEW CHALLENGES IN AMERICA AND EUROPE

CHAPTER I
THE HUMAN FACTOR IN WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS
ACROSS NATIONAL BORDERS

Mark Godsey

1. Introduction ....................................................................................... pag. 13
2. Confirmation bias and faulty forensic conclusions....... » 16
3. Memory problems, eyewitness identification and false
   confessions .................................................................................. » 24
4. Lie detection, tunnel vision and police/prosecutor
   misconduct.................................................................................. » 30
5. Conclusion....................................................................................... » 32

CHAPTER II
INNOCENCE WORK IN THE AMERICAS

Justin Brooks

1. Introduction ....................................................................................... pag. 33
2. The challenges.................................................................................. » 34
3. The future ....................................................................................... » 36

© Wolters Kluwer
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### CHAPTER III
**ACCOUNTING FOR THE POTENTIAL OF ERROR IN THE EVALUATION OF THE WEIGHT OF SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE**

*J. Vuille, A. Biedermann, F. Taroni*

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................ pag. 39
2. Erroneous scientific evidence ................................................................. » 40
3. Uncertainty in forensic science ................................................................. » 44
4. Uncertainty in the evaluation of forensic findings: the role of probability and Bayesian inference .......... » 45
5. Interpreting scientific evidence with Bayes’ Theorem: the example of forensic DNA evidence .................... » 48
   5.1. An introduction to forensic DNA analysis ............ » 48
   5.2. Probabilistic evaluation of DNA profiling results ........................................................................ » 50
   5.3. Probabilistic evaluation of DNA profiling results and the potential of error ......................... » 52
6. Conclusion ........................................................................................................ » 55

### CHAPTER IV
**WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS AS A RESULT OF POLITICAL PRESSURE**

*Martin Killias*

1. Wrongful convictions: an American subject? .................. pag. 57
2. Factors that increase risk of miscarriages of justice ...... » 59
3. Almost forgotten: “intentional” miscarriages of justice .......... » 62
4. Outreau and DSK: two cases in France ...................... » 64
5. The Torino Eternit trial: an emblematic case .............. » 65
   5.1. The background ........................................................................ » 65
   5.2. The defendant and asbestos .............................................. » 67
   5.3. Reactions to a tragedy of huge dimensions .......... » 70
   5.4. Confusing legal technicalities............................................. » 71
   5.5. Distorting facts .................................................................. » 75
   5.6. The *Deus ex machina*: the Supreme Court .......... » 77
   5.7. Not over yet ........................................................................ » 78
6. Preventing and remedying abusive trials ...................... » 79

© Wolters Kluwer
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART II
WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN EUROPE:
PREVENTION AND REMEDIES

CHAPTER V
THE EMERGING PHENOMENON OF WRONGFUL
CONVICTIONS IN THE NETHERLANDS:
CAUSES AND SOLUTIONS
G.G.J. Knoops, E.L.I. Bell

1. Introduction ....................................................... pag. 83
2. Identifying the number of wrongful convictions .... » 86
   2.1. Introduction: comparative issues .................. » 86
   2.2. Wrongful conviction ‘crimes’ ......................... » 87
3. Reopening criminal cases within the Dutch criminal
   justice system ................................................ » 89
   3.1. Introduction ................................................ » 89
   3.2. The law on redressing miscarriages of justice .... » 89
   3.3. The ACAS system ......................................... » 95
4. Causes of wrongful convictions ............................ » 98
   4.1. False confessions and true denials ................. » 99
   4.2. Forensic errors .......................................... » 103
5. The inquisitorial justice system and its impact upon
   miscarriages of justice .................................. » 105
6. Conclusions and recommendations ..................... » 109

CHAPTER VI
MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE AND AWARENESS
OF THE ITALIAN JUDGE
Giuseppe Gennari

1. Premises .......................................................... pag. 111
2. The inertia effect on wrongful convictions .......... » 112
3. What can we do in Italy to protect innocent people? ... » 114

CHAPTER VII
REMEDIES FOR MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE IN ITALY
Mitja Gialuz

1. Introduction ....................................................... pag. 117
2. Revision as main mechanism of reparation for
   miscarriage of justice .................................... » 121

© Wolters Kluwer
TABLE OF CONTENTS

3. The exclusion of partial revision ........................................ pag. 124
4. The scope of application of revision.................................. » 125
5. Revision and new scientific evidence................................. » 128
6. Compensation for miscarriage of justice......................... » 133

Chapter VIII
WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN THE FRENCH CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM: SOME CONSIDERATION
Sylvain Cormier

1. Introduction ......................................................................... pag. 137
2. The revisions obtained before the law of 20 June 2014. » 140
3. Since the law of 20 June 2014: the Machin case .......... » 142

PART III
THE EXPERIENCE OF THE INNOCENCE PROJECTS IN EUROPE

CHAPTER IX
THE COMMON VOCABULARY OF INNOCENCE: INTERNATIONALIZATION OF THE INNOCENCE NETWORK AS A HUMAN RIGHTS ORGANISATION
David Langwallner

1. By way of an introduction ................................................. pag. 149
2. Local differences ............................................................. » 151
3. What then do we have in common?................................. » 153
4. Students: embedded learning and human right consciousness .................................................. » 158
5. Conclusions ................................................................. » 161

CHAPTER X
THE UK INNOCENCE MOVEMENT: PAST, PRESENT, AND FUTURE?
Holly Greenwood

1. Introduction ......................................................................... pag. 163
2. The UK innocence movement: the background .......... » 164
3. Research summary............................................................ » 169

© Wolters Kluwer
TABLE OF CONTENTS

4. The UK innocence movement: an overview................ pag. 170
   4.1. Limitations of the innocence project model ........ » 170
   4.2. Systemic problems ..................................... » 176
5. A view to the future................................................. » 183
6. Conclusion............................................................... » 191

CHAPTER XI
WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN POLAND
AND THE POLISH INNOCENT PROGRAM

Maria Ejchart – Dubois

1. Introduction.................................................................. pag. 193
2. Empowerments and major activity of Innocence Clinic » 194
3. Causes of miscarriage of justice................................. » 197
   3.1. Scene examination............................................. » 198
   3.2. Identification parade and incorrect identification
        by a witness....................................................... » 199
   3.3. Admission of guilty........................................... » 201
   3.4. Expert witness.................................................. » 202
   3.5. False accusation............................................... » 204
4. Summary................................................................. » 206

CHAPTER XII
WORKING WITH STUDENTS IN INNOCENCE
EFFORTS: MERITS AND CHALLENGES

Martina Cagossi

1. Premises....................................................................... pag. 207
2. Clinical legal education in United States and Europe... » 208
3. The benefits from working in an innocence project law
   clinic........................................................................ » 213
4. The Italy Innocence Project......................................... » 216

© Wolters Kluwer
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART IV
MISCELLANEOUS OF JUSTICE
UNDER A SOUTH AMERICAN PERSPECTIVE

CHAPTER XIII
WRONGFUL CONVICTIONS IN CHILE:
CHALLENGES FOR THE NEW
CRIMINAL PROCEDURE

A. Alvarado Urizar, I. Castillo Val

1. Introduction ................................................................. pag. 221
2. The origin of concern for the wrongfully convicted people: identifying the problem and its causes ..........  » 224
3. The Chilean experience on wrongful convictions ....... » 225
   3.1. Criminal procedure reform: from an inquisitorial procedure to an adversarial design.. » 225
   3.2. Brief analysis of the effective progress of the reform................................................................. » 227
   3.3. The role of precedents in general ......................... » 229
   3.4. Role of appeals for review before the Supreme Court................................................................. » 230
4. The conviction of innocent defendants in the new Chilean criminal procedure: selected case analysis....... » 236
   4.1. The Lobos Parra case .................................................. » 237
       4.1.1. Analysis of the trial and conviction of the V Oral Criminal Court of Santiago .. » 237
       4.1.2. The Police’s tunnel vision......................... » 238
       4.1.3. The state prosecution’s tunnel vision.... » 239
       4.1.4. The court’s tunnel vision ......................... » 240
       4.1.5. Analysis of the appeal for review and the Supreme Court’s decision.............. » 244
   4.2. The Robles Vergara case ................................. » 247
       4.2.1. The case and the trial court’s decision analysis and the appeal for annulment... » 247
       4.2.2. Appeal for review and the Supreme Court decision’s analysis ................. » 255
5. Conclusions ................................................................. » 257

© Wolters Kluwer